

Role of Tuition Centers in the Performance and Achievement of Students: A Case of Hyderabad District, Sindh, Pakistan

Zafarullah Sahito¹, Mumtaz Khawaja², Abida Siddiqui³, Anjum Shaheen², Humera Saeed⁴

¹School of Applied Educational Science and Teacher Education, Philosophical Faculty, University of Eastern Finland, Joensuu & Department of Education, Sukkur IBA, Sindh, Pakistan

²Department of Education, Faculty of Education, University of Sindh, Elsa Kazi Campus, Hyderabad, Sindh, Pakistan

³Department of Educational Management and Supervision, Faculty of Education, University of Sindh, Elsa Kazi campus, Hyderabad, Sindh, Pakistan

⁴Literacy and Education Department, Government of Sindh, Pakistan

Correspondence: Zafarullah Sahito, School of Applied Educational Science and Teacher Education, Philosophical Faculty, University of Eastern Finland, Joensuu & Department of Education, Sukkur IBA, Sindh, Pakistan.
E-mail: Zafarullah.sahito@gmail.com

Received: February 3, 2017

Accepted: March 3, 2017

Online Published: March 7, 2017

doi:10.11114/jets.v5i4.2262

URL: <https://doi.org/10.11114/jets.v5i4.2262>

Abstract

This research is designed to explore the importance of tuition centers in the perception of students. It tries to find out the role, supporting methods, environment and good characteristics of tuition centers, their owners and management to support the student to learn effectively and bring good grades in their board examinations. A qualitative research method employed to collect data from the 30 participating students who receive tuition at different centers of Hyderabad district. Semi-structured interview protocol was design; discussed with five experts of field; improved as per suggestions of field experts; piloted on three students; and then implemented and conducted on the recruited sample of students of class Higher Secondary Certificate -II (XII) in order to collect data. The results revealed that the students who receive tuition at different centers bring good grades in their examination and have suitable knowledge about their subjects taught at centers. Their previous grades were found good and attractive such as A-1 and A with more than 80% and 70% marks respectively, due to coaching received at tuition centers that time, reveled from experiences shared by students.

Keywords: coaching, tuition centers, higher secondary certificate, good grades, board examination

1. Introduction

In 21st century, the education system in the most of the countries is becoming very much competitive and challenging for students. Because, over the last several decades the industrial manufacturing economy has shifted to a service economy relying on information, knowledge and innovation (Apte, Karmarkar & Nath, 2008; Karmarkar & Apte, 2007). As the economic success of any nation is based on the effective utilization of intangible assets that are also considered as key resources for competitive advantage such as knowledge, skills, and innovative potential (Economic & Social Research Council, 2005). This rising value of education and the competition demands the students to be prepared and trained effectively and has a grip over the content knowledge to take up the challenges of the educational world in order to take good position and seats through admission process in schools, colleges and universities inside the country and abroad. Because without authentic technical and professional knowledge no organization may offer any good job, position and salary to any non-qualified and untrained one but on the other side many policymakers view and consider them as low-skill and low wage employee (Council on Competitiveness, 2008). As many of the fastest-growing jobs in the service sector are considered high-end occupations in USA such as doctors, lawyers, engineers, sales and marketing professionals. It is important to be a knowledgeable and skillful for a successful educational performance, career and future professional life. To become knowledgeable and skillful student, it is necessary to cope up with the studies at educational institutions and if needed to go further for help, it may be taken at home from any member of family such as grant parents, parents, brothers and sisters, etc. If the help is not available at home then the students go outside of the home and they may join any academy, tuition or coaching center where they can learn and solve their problems. The situation depends on the wish,

will and the financial condition of the students that how they are going to get help, may be through home tuition tutor which is expensive and or joining any tuition or coaching center. Students go to tuition centers for help in English language learning with all four skills but most of them go for spoken as to be confident and speak among many people in classroom and other places, while some get tuition of different subjects such as mathematics, physics, chemistry, computer, biology, etc. too. There are main two modes of seeking help in studies such as home tuition and tuition or coaching centers; and both modes have their own pros and cons to deal with the students to teach.

Coaching or tuition means the extra help that can be gained by students from any expert and subject specialist to overcome the issues and problems to get good understanding about the subject contents to achieve good marks and grades in examination. This help may be paid or non-paid depends on the condition and situation concern with the students, their tutors, and centers. Because many social organizations and social workers are running the coaching or tuition centers on free basis and on the other side, private tuition or extra coaching is given by the teachers to students to prepare them for examination and to earn extra income too (Foondun, 2002). However, in reality it is something different connected and concerned with several parents who afford the heavy fees may arrange home tuition teacher for their children as they can acquire full attention and learn effectively. In this form of tuition teacher gives full time and invests full energy on one or two students and teach them everything thoroughly and gives them a good attempts for practice in most of the subjects till the students get mastery over it. This is the best way to support students to prepare well for examination to get good grades and excel their performance. This is one side of the coin and however the home tuitions have certain pros and cons such as home tuition is like home schooling to get maximum help; one to one interaction between student and helper that provides opportunity to ask questions as many as he or she can to clear the concepts; individual and personal attention helps tutor to explore the weak areas and guide the student in proper way; parental monitoring is easy and reachable to watch the learning and progress of their child; it is accessible to discuss easily with teacher about the progress of child; it may be highly effective method to teach slow learner and the learner with any learning disability. But on the other side the student can't be able to get any help from any of his or her friend and peer; no competition will be found to motivate the children for more learning; and finally no comparisons will be made between students.

Tuition or coaching centers are like educational institutes having proper classroom with black or white board, chairs for students and teachers, other related things and materials those are necessary for teaching learning process to teach the students. The tutors impart education through taking classes or periods in the selective subjects as per time table made by the management of the center and the students have to attend them to acquire knowledge and skills. Whenever the students feel any difficulty and problem related to their subjects they send their queries or to ask questions directly from respective teachers and get proper suggestions and solutions too. These centers are good choice and option for bright students and for those who have good foundational or basic knowledge in their selective subjects in which the students want to take tuition. Tuition or coaching center is also a good option for those students who want to do combined studies to solve their difficulties; competitive environment support and motivate students well; peer and teachers help can faster the co-ordination to work hard and time management skills to learn well. But some centers have over crowded classes where student can't get individual attention to learn; parents can't get proper information and unable to keep proper check and balance; the environment of the centers can't support properly the weak students and slow learners; the content or course covering speed is faster that also negatively affect the learning attitude of student.

The significant difference found between the achievement of students belonging to tuition and non-tuition groups. The students of low achievement motivation improve their achievement in science subject by receiving private tuition (Gafoor & Sunnummel, 2007). Private tuition was a rare and had a general impression that only academically weak or dull students received tuition to increase their knowledge and skills to overcome their educational and literacy deficiencies. This phenomenon was negatively promoted and the real facts were hidden by students from their classmates and teachers as to not appear as a weak and dull student (Arora, 2002). But the reality was different that most of the students do take private tuition to complete their courses and understand the content properly, effectively and efficiently to get good grades in their school and college years. Nowadays tuition perceived as a matter of necessity of all students and a symbol of pride and social prestige for students and parents of the middle class families in urban, semi-urban and rural areas too. The few implications of private coaching for educational practice are significant such as tutoring is effective, if it should be provided to failure students, who cannot afford the fee, to avoid the social inequalities in educational environments for better academic achievement. Do not engage students for a long period of time in tutoring, to prevent students from other developmental activities such as play, socializing with peers, sports and extracurricular activities to become a developed, well-adjusted and creative adults; at tuition centers the students taught the school curriculum ahead in advance that make student inattentive and uninvolved in class because they perceive that they had already covered the material and create problems for other classmates and teachers inside the class and school (Kenny & Faunce, 2004).

1.1 Background of the Study

Pakistan is one the south Asian country located in Asia continent, sharing the borders with China, India, Iran and Afghanistan. It has four provinces, such as Balochistan, Punjab, Pakhtunkhwa and Sindh; federally administered tribal areas (FATA); and northern administrative tribal areas (NATA). Sindh is one of the provinces of Pakistan, situated in the southern part of the country touching the tides of Arabian Sea, having a busiest harbor and seaport. Sindh remained a part of the Indo-Pakistan sub-continent and a province of the Indian Empire during British rule. It is considered and counted among the oldest civilizations of the world, known as Indus civilization, connected with Moen-jo-Daro, the 5000 year's oldest one. The word Sindh means the country or the land of the people of Indus, locally known as Sindhu, derived from the word "SINDHU" of Sanskrit language means the river (UNCRD, 1976). Indus is referred as river to promote and support the life and Sindh, referred to the gift or Bride of Indus, which is about 2000 miles long and passes through Pakistan and especially Sindh, diagonally from north to south and finally discharges into the Arabian Sea, after about to 590 miles travelling in Sindh.

Education in Pakistan is the purely responsibility of the Federal Ministry of Education and the provincial governments, whereas the federal government assists in curriculum development, accreditation and financing of the research and development. As the State is responsible to provide law (Article 25-A, Constitution of Pakistan 1973) may determine free and compulsory education to all children of the age of five to sixteen years in a manner as, as consists of the age group of 3 to 16 years. The education system in Pakistan is divided into six levels such as Preschool (for 3 to 5 years old children); primary level (for 5 to 10 years old children or consists of grades one to five); middle level (consists of grades six to eight); high school level (consist of grades nine and ten, it leads to the Secondary School Certificate or SSC); intermediate (consists of grades eleven and twelve, leading to a Higher Secondary (School) Certificate or HSC); and university programs leading to undergraduate, graduate and post graduate degrees (Thomas, Wang & Fan, 2001). In Sindh province the intermediate (consists of grades eleven and twelve, leading to a Higher Secondary (School) Certificate or HSC) is handled by higher secondary schools and colleges, such as science and arts colleges available in different areas of the province as per the needs, requirement, policy and planning of public and government respectively. As per rough estimation, the college education and system (HSC) is suffering from a high level of risky issues, hurdles and problems throughout the province of Sindh. As, it was recommended that the higher secondary schools may be renamed as "Intermediate School" or "Higher Secondary College" for classes IX-XII, and must be merged in to higher secondary schools (NEP, 2009; 1979), to provide the facilities of computer and science laboratory, library, playground and full staff, according to SNE must be provided to every higher secondary school of rural and urban areas of Sindh (Ahmed & Lodhi, 2012). Furthermore, the summative assessments of grade 10 to 12 are to be administered by the Boards of Intermediate and Secondary Education (BISE) throughout the province. Whereas, the grade 12 or Higher secondary education is called the Higher Secondary School Certificate (HSSC) examinations, which is a pre-requisite for admission to tertiary, higher education and specialized vocational diplomas in all fields of engineering, medical, natural and basic sciences, social sciences and humanities (ADP, 2013 - 14). That's why the students care a lot to learn more and get good grades as to get admission in their interested field of study. For the good performance and achievement, students try their level best to learn at their higher secondary schools and colleges. Still many students want more help to overcome the problems and have a good grip over the content of their subjects to acquire good grade in examinations to convert their wish into real and true condition.

First time in the history of education of Sindh, government of Sindh has commissioned a large-scale study to assess the progress of school students through a research project named standardized achievement test (SAT). Test was conducted in the subjects of mother tongue, math and science, on 102,823 students of 3,500 public schools throughout the province in 2012. The results lead to identify the gaps in present education system to reach the conclusion to recommend some suggestions to the policy decisions in order to improve the quality of education and its delivery. The overall results portrait a very comprehensive picture that shows a poor quality of education delivery, and its cumulative average scores were 22% students have been achieved in all three subjects, with 32% in mother tongue, 19% in general science, and 15% in elementary math in whole province of Sindh, Pakistan. Whereas, Karachi region leads with 32% , Hyderabad region with 20%, Mirpur Khas and Sukkur regions with 19% each, and Larkana region with 15%, the lowest average scoring as cumulative average results respectively. The following major recommendations are suggested to the policy makers, provincial and district educational management and administrative authorities such as effective school-based training programmes for all teachers and heads, introduction and implementation of systematic follow up procedures, in-depth understanding of teachers' development and performance, effective examination system to assess learning outcomes of students, selection and promotion of teachers, school heads and district education authorities, on purely merit basis, and elimination of political influence at provincial and district levels (GOS-SAT, 2012).

The government of Sindh had established 49,125 educational institutions in the province (Semis 2010) but the educational standard of these institutions declining day by. The analysis of examination results of class XI showed a

great fall of marks around 8% from class X results that caused drop out of students and admission problems in professional colleges and universities after XII. Therefore, the Government wants to overcome these problems, as higher secondary education (IX to XII) became an important sector in entire educational system, to provide continuity of studies through admission into professional universities and colleges, to provide the middle level work force for the better economy of the country (Ahmed & Lodhi, 2012). As the education is integrally linked with the development process that play a key role in the progress of any country to increase the literacy rate like in Pakistan it has increased from 18.3% to 57.2% from 1951 to 2009 (Statistical Survey, 2009). Due to these conditions, students do not progress in learning at their school level, which is considered as the foundation of knowledge, as it is said that strong foundation can hold and bear the load of huge building. Future study, profession and career are the parts of huge building of any student of present and a successful professional of the future. It has been observed that when students feel uncomfortable to get suitable and result oriented input at their schools, then they start to search outside for help to meet the challenges, issues and difficulties in their studies and examinations. The most frequently exercise of the students is to join coaching centers to get maximum help to meet the challenges of their students' life to get success and good grades in their examinations. In this regards, college teachers to implement the curriculum that disconnected with real life due to lack of resources, teachers and teaching pedagogies faced several problems. That's why the missing role of teachers' involvement in curriculum development process needs to be recognized to update the curriculum to meet educational needs of college students in Sindh, Pakistan (Syeda, 2015). Therefore, the 48,865 Government schools were investigated to explore the efficient, well-organized allocation and utilization of resources to incorporate a wide range of micro data variables available in the year of 2011-12 to provide an insight about the quantity of education (Mujahid & Noman, 2015) that impact the quality of education and learning of students. As it aims to ensure, equal access to education opportunities to all the citizen of Pakistan (GOP, 2009).

1.2 Statement of the Problem

This study conducts to find out the views of higher secondary certificate (XI and XII) students regarding their studies, learning and securing good grades in their board examinations. These examinations are conducted by external agencies called Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education (BISE), such as Hyderabad, Karachi, Sukkur, Larkana and Mirpurkhas running and looking after by the government of Sindh in the province of Sindh, Pakistan. There are few other private boards and examination system working parallely such as Aga Khan examination board and Cambridge system too. For this study only the students of BISE, Hyderabad who are living in Hyderabad city were taken as the population. The students were recruited and selected from different tuition centers of Hyderabad city, Latifabad and Qasimabad the three talukas of Hyderabad district. Three students from each taluka were selected who are the students of private schools and colleges and got good marks in their matriculation and first year of HSC – I examination. These students have really a good exposure and experience of different tuition centers and the years respectively. Interviews were conducted from these selected students through discussion mode and the secrets of their learning and taking good grades were recorded in their own narratives as they said and their feelings were also observed. Because the main aim of this study is to know, what is the perception of students about tuition centers and how they learnt and prepared for BISE examination in order to bring good grades and vice versa. As the achievement in science subject of tuition taking and non-tuition taking groups were studied; and it was found that there was no significant difference between the particular levels of intelligence and achievement motivation of both groups, but the pupils of low achievement motivation students improved their achievement in science subjects by receiving private tuition (Kunnathodi & Sunnummel, 2007).

2. Literature Review

Private tuition is a deliberate choice and action of parents to deal with the needs of students and face with the social and economic pressures too (NIEPA, 2002). This phenomenon is still under discussion among the researchers that private tuition and coaching has positive impact on the learning and grades of the students and vice versa. There are some studies in the favour and some are in against it such as Scholastic Aptitude Test (SAT) scores in Mathematical components were improved by coaching (Becker, 1990; Smyth, 1989; Reynolds, Oberman & Perlman, 1988; Deaton, Halpin & Alford, 1987; Benson, 1986; Messick & Jungeblut, 1981) while the findings of some other researchers are that the coaching has no effect on SAT or Academic tests (Kenny & Faunce, 2004; Scholes & Lain, 1997; Witt, Al-Abdulla & Ross, 1994; Becker, 1990; Snedecor, 1989; Gastright, 1983) further in this regard the findings of few researchers remained normal that there is moderate effect of coaching on Entrance Examination scores (Allalouf & Ben-Shakhar, 1998; Jone, 1986). Furthermore, it was concluded on the basis of observation that coached and uncoached students perform equally in most of the subjects they taught (Kenny & Faunce, 2004; Kenny & Stone, 2000; Witt, Al-Abdulla & Ross, 1994; Bekcer, 1990; Snedecor, 1989; Achuff & Lila, 1988; Gastright, 1983) but the students having low achievement motivation can improve their learning and achievement in Science subjects by private tuition and coaching (Kenny & Stone, 2000; Kulik, Bengert-Drown & Kulik, 1984).

Coaching at tuition academies or centers causes an additional burden on students and parents of middle class families but it is a major enticement for higher ethnic groups of the society who promoted the culture of home tuitions and academies. Because bearing the expenses of tuition is an indication of higher life style and a symbol of the behavioral patterns of rich families that directly impacts on household economy (Chaudhry & Javed, 2015). On the other hand, private institutions and academies are instrumental in quality education and considered a prerequisite for economic growth and human resource development increase the level of cognitive skills and productivity (OECD, 2012). Educational institutions are considered the social institutions of the society, if tuition centers or academies can be considered as social institutions who are trying to develop and satisfy the culturally derived and instrumental needs of the society, as education is one of the four basic instrumental needs (Goldschmidt, 1996). Because the expectation of students, parents and society are increasing day by day with high speed of knowledge creation and explosion to meet the demands of the market (Chan, 2016). In this regards, the educational institutions are trying their best to provide an environment to increase and enhance the skills, capacities and capabilities of the students, but unfortunately many gaps remained unfilled which are fulfilled by the tuition centers. In this regard, some special emphasize, on the tutoring system in Pakistan was initiated to achieve impressive results by giving special assistance to all students (Watson, 1982). Because, the school teachers are unable, to fully support their students due to many reasons, as it was described that the problem of quality teachers has been remained unsolved in Pakistan (Government of- Pakistan, 2009) that's why, the majority of educational polices and plans have discussed the need of quality teachers in Pakistan (Memon, 2007; Shami & Hussain, 2006). The quality teacher is not only the problem in Pakistan but other many issues are unsolved such as lack of leadership; curriculum and its instructions; physical facilities; honesty; sincerity; dedication; and commitment of all stakeholders are the main and important problems to solve for successful system of education. The second option is to assist students at tuition centers and academies, those were focus for assistance through different proposals to improve the educational process of tuition academies depending on better educational techniques, providing free notes and guess papers, and high practice of the syllabus to make education more luminous and career oriented. Because it is believed that education contributes to maintain whole social system and builds the national character of all stakeholders of the society (Parsons & Beauchamp 2012; Singh, 1992) through the recognition of the process of transmission of values, accumulation of knowledge, broad cultural context of teaching and learning and research oriented system (Wolcott, 1991).

There are many reasons for the demand of private tuition but the main are two such as the weaknesses of the students when they are unable to read, write and solve the exercises and the negligence of the teachers when they do not teach properly at school. In both cases, the students need help through tutoring outside the school. Tuition academies play a vital role in career building of the students through knowledge development because it is power and its attainment is necessary for every student. To pay extra money for tuition to academies owners was confirmed by parents to grow interest of students in education and learning at academies. Parents strive hard to pay high expenses of their children's education and tuition and they are agreed to sacrifice their other desires too to afford extra expenses for the best future of their offspring (Chaudhry & Javed, 2015). Parents attempt to provide tuition opportunity to their children to retain and get advantage to learn their syllabus to participate and win the education race for their secure and bright future (Foondun, 2002). The weaker students' do not take private tuition in mathematics subject only but most of the students want help to solve the different exercises. Some get help at their home from their family members and others go for private tuition where they get help to complete their syllabus that is the common practice of the majority of tutors. While students experienced to learn problem solving more easily in tutorial classes than in school (Das & Das, 2013).

3. Research Methodology

3.1 Research Method and Procedure

The qualitative research design was employed depending on philosophical assumptions of epistemologies and ontologies (Crotty, 1998) underpinned by the interpretivism the reality is multiple and epistemological constructionism the knowledge is constructed and subjective (Creswell, 2009). As the clear and concise explanations of the philosophies and theories tell that how to know about the social world and how to research it by using interviews (Edwards & Holland, 2013). The semi-structured interviews were conducted with the concept of role of tuition centers in the performance and achievement of students, as the semi structure interviewing is distinctive in emphasizing the importance of good practice to understand and undertake the phenomenon comprehensively within the framework of a clear philosophical position (Edwards & Holland, 2013). Furthermore, the semi-structured interviews are widely used to collect indepth qualitative data from the respondents of the subject to grow, enrich and enhance the methodological research literature (Polak & Green, 2016; Bjørnholt & Farstad, 2012), even though, to conduct semi structure interviews from two spouses together for the production of rich data, including with the observational data (Bjørnholt & Farstad, 2012). Students were recruited and then requested to share their life experience that how they get a help from the tuition centers where they are learning. Protocol consisted on two main parts such as bio-data and questions parts. In bio-data part the name, class, tuition center, marks of SSC-II and HSC-I, the years of taking tuition were given, while four

questions were asked from the respondents given as research question in this paper. For the collection of data from the respondents, the concept of the topic was designed, shared with them and then invited them to share their live life experiences about their learning and success in their examination. The data of interviews were kept confidential and the identity of the participants was protected (Shaw & Gould, 2001), as it is said that the qualitative research is better suited to delineate the personal meanings of the narrated sentences of the participants without losing the richness and genuineness (Flick, 1998; Strauss & Corbin, 1998).

An inductive thematic analysis process and procedure was done on the transcripts of interviews using a six-phase procedure described by Braun & Clarke (2006). As all interviews were transcribed properly, wisely and then the transcription was given back to students in order to get conformation that, their said ideas and concept are properly sketched on the paper in black and white. The codes were generated and converted into potential themes; the potential themes and relevant data were merged; and then all transcript themes and data were reviewed to conform, check and cross check all steps. Finally, all transcripts, themes and data were refined and combined into larger themes, which are given in the tables. For the validity of the interview protocol and data, the study was guided and supported by a relativist approach, means to follow the criteria for judging the quality, drawn from an ongoing list of the characterizing traits (Sparkes & Smith, 2009, 2014). It includes the worthiness of the topic; the significant contribution to literature; rich rigor; selection of sample depending on appropriateness; meaningful and significant claims generated from the data; coherence of research; the appropriate selection of methods and the results (Tracy, 2010).

3.2 Research Questions

- Q.1. What is the perception of students about tuition centers?
 Q.2. What are the most attractive and supportive characteristics of tuition centers?
 Q.3. How tuition centers manage their learning environments?
 Q.4. How tuition centers help and support the students to learn well and bring good grades in their BISE examination?

3.3 Delimitations

This study is delimited up to the students of tuition centers of Hyderabad city, Latifabad and Qasimabad the three talukas of Hyderabad district. Only students of HSC-II (XII) belonging to public and private schools and colleges were taken as the population and sample.

3.4 Participants and Their Recruitment

All HSC-II (XII) students taking tuition at centers of Hyderabad, Latifabad and Qasimabad were constituted as the population of the study. Thirty students in total were recruited, means ten students from each taluka were taken as the sample of the study as the number of participants may be several ranging from 1 or 2 to 30 or 40, depends on the need to report details about each individual or site (Creswell, 2012). The purposive sampling technique was used to select the tuition centers and the simple random sampling technique was used to select the targeted sample of the students. Twelve students had A-1 grade means secured more than 80% marks and rest eighteen students had A grade means secured more than 70% marks in their BISE matriculation (SSC-II) examination. In the same sample, sixteen students got more than 80% and fourteen secured more than 70% marks in their HSC-I examination too.

4. Results

Following is the interpretation and analysis of Students' interviews.

4.1 What Is the Perception of Students about Tuition Centers?

Twenty-three (77%) students expressed their views highly positive regarding the tuition centers that these are the quality institutions where every student gets suitable and reasonable attention of teachers and administration to listen the problems of students and try their level best to find out the proper and authentic solution that effects positively on the learning of students. While remaining seven (23%) students said that the tuition centers are the suitable and reasonable place to have good friends to enjoy and learn well to get good results in life for better future. Some quotations are as under:

Table 1. (Theme-1)–Perception of Students

Sub themes	Statements of Students	Interviewee No
Time allocation and explanation of topic	<i>Teachers give suitable time to comprehensive explanation of the topic.</i>	8
	<i>Teachers give suitable time and opportunity to ask questions regarding the explained topic.</i>	13
	<i>Teachers repeat the explanation of the topic many times on the demand of the students.</i>	19
	<i>Teachers explain topic with different style of teaching as per students ease and convenience.</i>	22
	<i>Teachers do not move to next topic until the majority of the students do learn the topic.</i>	30

4.2 How Tuition Centers Manage Their Learning Environments

Twenty-eight (93%) students said that the tuition centers are private owner institutions and the majority of the owners are teachers and some are administrators having an extensive and gigantic experience in the field of education. Some tuition centers run by a group of teachers on partner basis and they all partners are directly involve in different assignments to perform like teaching, guidance, counseling, trainings, marketing, outreach activities and management of day to day matters. They plan, organize, lead, control and adopt everything as per discussion, decision and policy that's why the outlook of the centers, classes, waiting area, discussion rooms, library, etc. are up to mark and students are always advices to do and behave as per the policy of the center. For positive effect, the advices are written on the attractive painted and printed boards those are installed on the different places of walls inside and outside of the classes.

Table 2. (Theme-2)–Personal ownership

Sub themes	Statements of Students	Interviewee No
Personal ownership to manage institution.	<i>Teachers do every work on time.</i>	3
	<i>Teachers seem to have an advance planning for every work and assignment.</i>	9
	<i>Teachers do high type of cooperation to each other and with students too.</i>	16
	<i>Teachers and administration staff try to infuse ownership spirit, habits and actions among students too.</i>	20
	<i>Many types of activities are design to involve students to take care of their classrooms, center and other related materials.</i>	25

4.3 How Tuition Centers Help and Support the Students to Learn Well and Bring Good Grades in Their BISE Examination

Nineteen (63%) students said that at tuition centers we get easy and understandable instructions to learn the topics. The remote of teaching pace of teachers is in the hands of students and teachers would move when they became satisfied with the level of learning and the green signal of movement of the majority of the students. Beside this the conduction of frequently regular and surprised tests also play vital role to increase the level of learning through trial and error theory. The remaining eleven (37%) students said that all teachers at tuition centers are in touch of their subjects with good regular practice, highly qualified, experienced and working in different educational organization at morning time. Teachers, administrators and classmates at tuition centers help and support all the students positively to learn inside and outside of the classrooms. Students give proper time, opportunity to ask questions and discussions, test practices, proper feedback based on monitoring and mentoring activities.

Table 3. (Theme-3)–Teaching, learning and preparation

Sub themes	Statements of Students	Interviewee No
Teaching, learning and preparation for board examination through regular and surprised tests	<i>Teachers' instructions are easy to understand and learn.</i>	2
	<i>Teachers' give homework and assignment to make and present in class.</i>	4
	<i>Teachers' conduct weekly, monthly and surprised tests to give good practice to learn.</i>	5
	<i>Regular testing system keep students active and learn from the shared experiences of successful students.</i>	6
	<i>Every position holder share his or her views after results and share success techniques with their classmates.</i>	10
	<i>Regular testing system provides suitable, practical and sound opportunities to all students to be warmly in touch of study and learning.</i>	11
	<i>Regularly learning and practising through test students get good grip on knowledge and time management to solve question paper completely and successfully.</i>	18
	<i>Different question papers are discussed in class to learn the authentic techniques of solution, made by students and teachers.</i>	21
	<i>Teachers suggest many things to students after getting views about them through classroom observations and assessment of papers.</i>	27
	<i>Teachers also do individual counseling and guidance of the students.</i>	28
	<i>Teachers also do individual counseling and guidance therapy of students to increase their motivation for better Learning and grades.</i>	29

4.4 What Are the Most Attractive and Supportive Characteristics of Tuition Centers?

Twenty one (70%) students said that the most attractive and supportive characteristics of tuition centers are cleanliness of classes and other all areas; suitable ventilation system; availability of furniture, light or electricity, fans, black or white boards, markers, computer lab, multimedia and drinking water facilities. The remaining nine (30%) students added something more in the list such as availability of trained and competent faculty; behaviour, socialization and extra support of teaching and non-teaching staff; availability of security guards and peons; provision of written notes; mixed language medium of instructions such as English, Urdu and Sindhi; conduction of regular and surprise test; transparent system of testing where answer copies are shown and discussed with students; provision of guess papers,

their preparation, testing and assessment; proper time allocation and management of classes; time allocation for students guidance; counseling and guidance system for students; individual monitoring and mentoring system depending on the feedback and suggestions for future work; extra class conduction on the request and demand of students before BISE final examination.

Table 4. (Theme-4)–Characteristics of tuition centers

Sub themes	Statements of Students	Interviewee No
Attractive and supportive characteristics of tuition centers	<i>Teaching-learning environment is very much conducive and favourable.</i>	1
	<i>Extra ordinary cleanliness, lighting and ventilation of classrooms and all related areas.</i>	7
	<i>Availability of fundamental and basic needed material resources such as computer, multimedia, boards, generator, etc.</i>	12
	<i>Qualified, competent, trained and professionally sound faculty.</i>	14
	<i>Social and respectable behaviour and dealing of teachers.</i>	17
	<i>Availability of security guards make environment effective.</i>	23
	<i>Ten to fifteen guess papers are to be provided to do good practice for examination.</i>	24
	<i>Mentoring and monitoring system give a proper and suitable insight to every student to plan well for their future.</i>	26

The dimensions of positiveness and effectiveness of tuition centers were founded from the interpretation and analysis of the collected data. The list comprises of many important and attractive dimensions such as reliable and supportive human resources (RSHR), attractive and useful material resources (AUMR) and effective quality system resources (EQSR). RSHR include, highly qualified and well-trained faculty; place of networking to have respectable teachers and good friends; owners are working their selves as teaching and admin staff effectively to get firsthand knowledge all the time; all partners are the members of management council of tuition centers to make, execute, implement and decide their selves. AUMR include, availability of all basic needed physical facilities; suitable, attractive and decorated classes and building; cleanliness, tidy and supportive environment. EQSR include, vision of working philosophy revolves around the problem solving approach; positive attitude and behaviour followed by socialization and extra support; effective teaching, practice, testing, assessment and feedback system followed by supportive monitoring, mentoring and suggestions giving system to plan and proceed for better future; and tuition centers are quality education institutions.

5. Discussion

More than 36,000 private educational institutions are working in Pakistan to attend and fulfill the educational needs of 6.3 million children. There were approximately 3,300 private primary and secondary schools in 1983 all over the four provinces of Pakistan (Jimenez, Emmanuel, & Tan, 1987), but they increased and reached to 32, 000 in 2000 AD. This increase of private institutions in Pakistan indicates the main two reasons such as the weakness of government to install quality educational institutions and interest of parents to choose private institutions for their children education. As, it was argued that because of immense resource requirement, it is difficult for the government to achieve the objective of universalization of primary education. Therefore, the opening of primary schools is considered an additional effort of the government towards universalization (Ministry of Education 2004). Even government and private schools and colleges are unable to fulfill the 100% needs of the students that is why students rush towards tuition centers to get help as per their need and requirement. Tuition centers are running by private owners, as their personal business and they always try for the maximization of benefits. Private tuition considered a big business in some of the countries, where families invest enough amount on their children's education from early school years to professional careers (Bray, 1999). The owners try their level best to facilitate their customers (students) to work for their marketing in the society. There objectives are clear about their business, policies, working style, facilities provision, marketing and the final production, as the success of students, to bring good grades in their examination. They try their level best to discuss, help and provide facilities to all stakeholders to maintain teaching learning environments at their centers. Even they work continuously to increase their business through starting new courses, diplomas, workshops and training programs. Normally tuition centers have coaching classes, to teach different subjects such as English language classes, mathematics, physics, chemistry and biology. In English language classes, spoken English course is very famous from students' point of view to improve their language skills and confidence. As the English language skills (ELs) and achievement gaps (Fry, 2007) require more preparation, practice, guidance and support of well trained teachers to increase the performance, achievement and success of the students (Cochran-Smith & Fries, 2005), particularly for the helpless students community (Gandara & Maxwell-Jolly, 2006). Because, tuition programs and activities can contribute positively to the academic growth of the children, who receive the tutoring classes with interest for learning (Fitz-Gibbon, 1977; Devin-Sheehan, Feldman, & Allen, 1976; Ellson, 1976; Rosenshine & Furst, 1969) depended and demonstrated only for well-structured and cognitively oriented programs. As the private tuition has been established a global trend that is high and expected to increase further in coming years in many developing and developed countries

such as Cambodia, Egypt, India, Japan, Kenya, Malta, Romania, Taiwan and Mauritius to support formal education parallelly (Bray, 2003).

Private coaching or tuition centers work well through advanced planning, practical and clear policies, good governance, provision of physical resources, creation and maintenance of teaching learning environment, time allocation, opportunities to learn, and the main thing is to work for the maximum benefit of their customer (students'). All students are given opportunity to work well; share their study issues with their teachers; share their experiences and ask questions to clear their doubts about any topic and chapter; do practice on board in classrooms, library and waiting areas; take time from teachers for further counseling may be in group and individually; do preparation for weekly, monthly and surprise test to keep them up to date; solve different type of question papers of BISE, to get confidence and become ready to appear in papers, to bring good grades to pursue their future as an important professional, to serve the community and society. Because, interest in subject, perception of its usefulness, desire to attain, self-confidence, self-esteem, patience and persistence, increase the motivation level of students to learn (Davis, 1999; Sass, 1989; Bligh, 1971). Furthermore, injecting relevant and practical information in to lectures; encourage students to participate; revise and review previous lectures; using explanatory phrases; proper use of chalk and board; provide specific course objectives; adaptation of easy reference; concentrate on the core curriculum and respect the students; were found the important factors of students motivation (Bamosa & Ali, 2000) to learn well, which are available at tuition centers, revealed from the data. No doubt, the college and tuition teachers are competent enough to teach their students but the problem is the leadership, planning, management and good governance, which is not available in government colleges. Because many college teachers render their services at tuition centers at evening time and there they come before time, take their classes regularly, guide their students properly with social attitude and dealing. However, at their colleges they consider themselves as officers to rule as a king not as the teacher to guide their students. This whole picture may be bad or ugly is due to lacking of leadership, management, governance, curriculum development and instruction, assessment and evaluation. However, it can be good, when the all-permanent stakeholders like human resources expect to do well, and they tend to try hard, and to continue their efforts to perform better (Pintrich & Schunk, 2002). Students who believe in hard work are much more likely to be motivated to take efforts, remain persistence and behavior positively to get success (Pintrich & Schunk, 2002; Eccles, Wigfield & Schiefele, 1998; Bandura, 1997) such to bring good grades in their examination. The basic construct refers to the beliefs of students about the causes of success and failure, and how much they perceived, the control on outcomes or one's behavior (Skinner, 1996; Weiner, 1986), whereas the students must believe that, their efforts will lead them to success. The assurance of their belief enables them to manage their activities, emotions and perform well at high levels than students who do not feel in control (Pintrich & Schunk, 2002; Skinner, Zimmer-Gembeck & Connell, 1998).

It has listened from majority of the parents that their children go for tuition due to having problems in their studies at schools and colleges because the government and private educational institutes do not have a powerful capacity to solve the problems and provide the suitable environment and opportunities to every students to learn well in their classrooms. There is no quality education in majority of the public and private institutions due to no proper and authentic check and balance by the monitoring organization, department and cell. There is no responsible authority to look after the quality and take its measures as universities have quality enhancement cell (QEC). Without quality, no institution could be able to provide any effective environment and system to its students to grow well and develop their knowledge and skills. Because the main issue in the quality education in Pakistan is the lack of funds and political will (Iqbal & Ahmed, 2010). It discusses and believes by different stakeholders that the quality varies from context to context and organization to organization with one thing common that the quality is an instrument to achieve the organizational objectives (Ismail, 2010). But the main thing is how an educational institutions offers its services to their students (Seyfried, 2007) for better results such as relevance and excellence (Ullah, 2005) where excellence is the higher degree of goodness of services (Irfan & Kee, 2013). Furthermore, it is said that the tutoring programs have definite and positive effects on the academic performance and attitudes of tuition receiving students; they perform well and compete their peers in examinations; and expressed positive attitudes toward the learning of their tutoring subjects (Cohen, Kulik & Kulik, 1982).

6. Conclusion

We conclude on the bases of collected data, its interpretation and analysis that the majority of students who receive tuition at tuition centers are highly motivated for their studies and future endeavors. Because they know the importance of investment and its impact on their future in terms of finances, time, energy, attention and hard work. They also know that tuition centers have a positive impact on their learning and grades because they perceive that the private tuition is an extra school instructions (ESI) provided outside of the regular school structure by privately hired tutors in school subjects especially in mathematics and science after the end of the normal school day (Wolf, 2002). The two main reasons of students' attention, attraction and motivation were found towards tuition such as the interest of students and

support of their parents. Where students wanted to learn more to increase their subject or content knowledge to get admission in the discipline of their choice and parents also wanted the success of their children. This structured support in school subjects is called shadow education (Stevenson & Baker, 1992) follows the school curriculum with the potential to make a substantial contribution to students' performance and achievement in annual examinations and national tests. Tuition academies have become an integral ingredient of socialization and scholastic grooming and development of the students and their main contribution is to build a connection like bridge between the potential career aspirations and motivation of students through knowledge acquisition and skill development (Chaudhry & Javed, 2015). Here everything is found ok, good and very attractive for those students whose parents could pay the heavy fees of their children's schools and tuition centers. Even though, some ratio of students do pay their tuition fees their selves due to unavailability of finances with their parents. They work their selves at some shops or teach students of low classes and grades to earn money to pay their own fees.

However, the main thing is that how much ratio of total national population is able to pay tuition or coaching fees of their children. To deal with this big problem and national cause it would be responsibility of government to improve the standard of the schools or colleges, curriculum, teachers, teaching methods and teaching aids through radical reforms like Finland and Singapore. Therefore, it is suggested to make an organization responsible for the quality of education at public and private schools respectively and separately. There is also a need of collaboration between private and public schools to exchange their good practices to each other for better results and achievement. Furthermore, it is also suggested to think about the majority of the population of the country and try to work on no child left behind.

References

- Achuff, & Lila, (1988). The effect of combined parent-child tutoring on the achievement of urban primary grade students. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 49, 139.
- Ahmed, M. I., & Lodhi, F. A. (2012). A Comparative study of the role of public higher secondary schools in rural and urban Sindh. *Indus Journal of Management & Social Sciences*, 6(1) 76-90.
- Allalouf, A., & Ben-Shakhar, G. (1998). The Effect of coaching on the predictive validity of scholastic aptitude tests. *Journal of Educational Measurement*, 35(1), 31-47. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1745-3984.1998.tb00526.x>
- Annual Development Programmes (ADP), Sindh. (2013-14). Planning and Development Department, Government of Sindh.
- Apte, U. M., Karmarkar, U. S., & Nath, H. (Spring 2008). Information Services in the U.S. Economy: Value, Jobs, and Management Implications. *California Management Review*. <https://doi.org/10.2307/41166443>
- Arrora, G.L (2003). Private Tuition why not? *Edutracks*, 2, 6-8.
- Bamosa, A. O., & Ali, B. A. (2000). Factors affecting student motivation: Perception of pre-clinical students in the college of medicine, King Faisal University, Dammam, Saudi Arabia. *Journal of Family & Community Medicine*, 7(1), 55-61.
- Bandura, A. (1997). *Self-efficacy: The exercise of control*. New York: Freeman.
- Becker, B. J. (1990). Coaching for the Scholastic Aptitude Test: Further Synthesis and appraisal. *Review of Educational Research*, 60, 373-417. <https://doi.org/10.3102/00346543060003373>
- Benson, J. (1986). Effect of test-wisness training and ethnicity on achievement of third and fifthgrade students. *Measurement and Evaluation in counseling and Development*, 18(4), 156-112.
- Bjørnholt, M., & Farstad, G. R. (2012). Am I rambling?' On the advantages of interviewing couples together. *Qualitative Research*, 14(1), 31-39. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1468794112459671>
- Bligh, D. A. (1971). *What's the Use of Lecturing?* Devon, England: Teaching Services Centre, University of Exeter.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77-101. <https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa>
- Bray, M. (1999) *The Shadow Education System: private tutoring and its implications for planners*, Paris, UNESCO, International Institute for Educational Planning.
- Bray, M. (2003). *Adverse effects of private supplementary tutoring: dimensions, implications and government responses*. Comparative Education research Centre, The University of Hong Kong.
- Chan, R. Y. (2016). Understanding the purpose of higher education: An analysis of the economic and social benefits for completing a college degree. *Journal of Education Policy, Planning and Administration*, 6(5), 1-40. Retrieved from: <http://www.jeppa.org>

- Chaudhry, W., & Javed, F. (2015). Impact of Tuition Academies on Household Economy: Enunciation of indigenous standpoints. *International Journal of Business and Behavioral Sciences*, 5(2), 1-10.
- Cochran-Smith, M., & Fries, M. (2005). *The AERA panel on research and teacher education: Context and goals*. In M. Cochran-Smith & K. Zeichner (Eds.), *Studying teacher education: The report of the AERA panel on research and teacher education* (pp.37- 68). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Cohen, P. A., Kulik, J. A., & Kulik, C. L. C. (1982). Educational Outcomes of Tutoring: A Meta-analysis of Findings. *American Educational Research Journal*, 19(2), 237-248. <https://doi.org/10.3102/00028312019002237>
- Council on Competitiveness. (April, 2008). *Thrive. The Skills Imperative*. Washington, DC.
- Creswell, J. W. (2009). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches*, 3rd (ed.). London, England: Sage Publications.
- Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational Research, Planning, Conducting, and Evaluating Quantitative and Qualitative Research*, 4th (ed.). Boston, USA: Pearson Education, Inc.
- Crotty, M. (1998). *The foundations of social research: Meaning and perspective in the research process*. London, England: Sage Publications.
- Das, G. C., & Das, D. R. (2013). An Empirical View on Private Tutoring in School Mathematics of Kamrup District. *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications*, 3(5), 1-8.
- Davis, B. G. (1999). *Tools for Teaching*, University of California, Berkeley, CA.
- Deaton, W. L., Halpin, G., & Alford, T. (1987). Coaching effects on California Achievement Test scores in elementary grades. *Journal of Educational Research*, 80, 149-155. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220671.1987.10885742>
- Devin-Sheehan, L., Feldman, R. S., & Allen, V. L. (1976). Theory and research on cross age and peer interaction: A review of the literature. *Review of Educational Research*, 46, 355-385. <https://doi.org/10.3102/00346543046003355>
- Eccles, J., Wigfield, A., & Schiefele, U. (1998). *Motivation to succeed*. In: W. Damon (Series Ed.) & N. Eisenberg (Vol. Ed.), *Handbook of child psychology: Vol. 3. Social, emotional, and personality development* (5th ed.), pp. 1017–1095). New York: Wiley.
- Economic and Social Research Council. (2005). *Knowledge Economy Fact Sheet*. Swindon, UK: Author.
- Edwards, R., & Holland, J. (2013). *What is Qualitative Interviewing?* Bloomsbury academic publishing plc, New York: USA.
- Ellson, D. G. (1976). *Tutoring*. In N. Gage (ed.) *The Psychology of Teaching Methods*, Chicago, IL, University of Chicago Press.
- Fitz-Gibbon. C. T. (1977). *An Analysis of tin-Literature of Cross-Age Tutoring*. Washington. D C: National Institution of Education.
- Foondun, R. A. (2002). The issue of private tuition: The practice in Mauritius and selected South-East Asian countries. *International Review of Education*, 48(6), 485-515. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1021374811658>
- Fry, R. (2007). *How far behind in math and reading are English language learners?* Washington, DC: Pew Hispanic Center.
- Gafoor, A. K., & Sunnummel, M. (2007). Effect of Private Tuition on Achievement in Science of Secondary School Pupils. *Journal of Community Guidance & Research*, 24(3), 316-325.
- Gándara, P., & Maxwell-Jolly, J. (2006). *Critical issues in developing the teacher corps for English learners*. In K. T éllez & H. C. Waxman (Eds.), *Preparing quality educators for English language learners: Research, policies, and practices* (pp. 99-120). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Gastright, J. (1983). *An experimental study of intensive test wiseness instruction on the reading gains of disadvantaged elementary school pupils*.
- Goldschmidt, W. (1996). *Comparative Functionalism: An Essay in Anthropological Theory*. Barkeley: University of California Press.
- Government of Pakistan [GOP]. (1979). *National Education Policy (NEP)*. Islamabad: Ministry of Education.
- Government of Pakistan [GOP]. (2009). *National Education Policy (NEP)*, M. o. Education, (ed.). City: Ministry of Education: Islamabad.

- Government of Sindh [GOS], (2012). *Statistical analysis of Standardized Achievement Test (SAT)-I results*. Education and Literacy department, Sindh, Pakistan.
- Iqbal, M. J., & Ahmed, M. (2010). Enhancing quality of education through e-learning: the case study of Allama Iqbal Open University. *The Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education*, 11(1), 84-97.
- Irfan, S., & Kee, D. (2013). Critical Success Factors of TQM and its Impact on Increased Service Quality: A Case from Service Sector of Pakistan. *Middle East Journal of Scientific Research*, 15(1), 61-74.
- Ismail, M. (2010). *Quality Enhancement Cells and Self-Assessment Report Writing Method*. City: University of AJK Muzaffarabad.
- Jones, R. (1986). The effect of Commercial Coaching courses on performance on the MCAT. *Journal of Medical Education*, 61(4), 85-91. <https://doi.org/10.1097/00001888-198604000-00001>
- Karmarkar, U. S., & Apte, U. M. (March 2007). Operations Management in the Information Economy: Information Products, Processes, and Chains. *Journal of Operations Management*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jom.2006.11.001>
- Kenny, D. T., & Faunce, G. (2004). Effect of Academic coaching on Elementary and Secondary School students. *The Journal of Educational Research*, 98, 109-126. <https://doi.org/10.3200/JOER.98.2.115>
- Kenny, D. T., & Stone, B. J. (2000). *The effects of coaching on scholarship type and academic performance of academically able students*. Unpublished paper.
- Kunnathodi, A. G., & Sunnummel, M. (2007). Effects of private tuition on achievement in science of secondary school pupils. *Journal of Community Guidance & Research*, 24(3), 316-325.
- Memon, G. R. (2007). Education in Pakistan: The key issues, problems and the new challenges. *Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 3(1), 47-55.
- Messick, S., & Jungeblut, A. (1981). Time and Method in coaching for the SAT. *Psychological Bulletin*, 95, 179-188. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0033-2909.89.2.191>
- Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan. (2004). National Education Policy, 1998-2010. <http://www.moe.gov.pk/>.
- Mujahid, N., & Noman, M. (2015). Infrastructure availability in the public sector schools: A Case study of Sindh Province. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 6(4), 60-68.
- NIEPA. (2002). *National Workshop on Para Teachers in Primary Education: Review of Experiences*. New Delhi.
- OECD. (2012). *Equity and Quality in Education: Supporting Disadvantaged Students and Schools*. OECD Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264130852-en>
- Parsons, J., & Beauchamp, L. (2012). *From knowledge to Action: Shaping the future of Curriculum Development in Alberta*. Alberta Education, Planning and standards Sector, Alberta, Canada.
- Pintrich, P. R., & Schunk, D. H. (2002). *Motivation in education: Theory, research, and applications* (2nd ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Polak, L., & Green, J. (2016). Using Joint Interviews to Add Analytic Value. *Qualitative Health Research*, 26(12), 1638-1648. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732315580103>
- Reynolds, A., Oberman, G., & Perlman, C. (1988). An analysis of a PSAT coaching program for urban gifted students. *Journal of Educational Research*, 81(3), 155-164. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220671.1988.10885816>
- Rosenshine, B., & Furst, N. (1969) *The Effects of Tutoring upon Pupil Achievement: a research review*. Washington DC, Office of Education.
- Sass, E. J. (1989). Motivation in the College Classroom: What Students Tell Us. *Teaching of Psychology*, 16(2), 86-88. https://doi.org/10.1207/s15328023top1602_15
- Scholes, R. J., & Lain, M. M. (1997, March). *The effect of test preparation activities on ACT assessment scores*. Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Educational Research Association, Chicago.
- Seyfried, E. (2007). *Indicators for quality in VET: to enhance European cooperation*. City: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities: Luxembourg. Assessing Quality of English Teachers at Secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan.
- Shami, P. A., & Hussain, K. S. (2006). *Development of education in Pakistan: Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Ministry of Education*.

- Shaw, I., & Gould, N. (2001). *Qualitative research in social work*. London, England: Sage Publications. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781849209694>
- Singh T. M. (1992). *Sociological Foundations of Education*. Bombay: Sheth Publisher.
- Skinner, E. A. (1996). A guide to constructs of control. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 71, 549-570. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0022-3514.71.3.549>
- Skinner, E., Zimmer-Gembeck, M., & Connell, J. (1998). Individual differences and the development of perceived control. *Monographs of the Society for Research in Child Development*, 63(2-3, Serial No. 254). <https://doi.org/10.2307/1166220>
- Smyth, F. L. (1989). Commercial coaching and SAT scores: The effects on college preparatory students in private schools. *The Journal of College Admissions*, 123, 2-7.
- Snedecor, P. J. (1989). Coaching: Does it pay – revisited? *The Journal of College Admissions*, 148, 32-35.
- Sparkes, A. C., & Smith, B. (2009). Judging the quality of qualitative inquiry: Criteriology and relativism in action. *Psychology of Sport and Exercise*, 10, 491-497. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psychsport.2009.02.006>
- Sparkes, A. C., & Smith, B. (2014). *Qualitative research methods in sport, exercise and health from process to product*. Oxford, England: Routledge.
- Statistical Survey, (2009). *Statistical survey of education in Pakistan*. Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad.
- Stevenson, & Baker, (1992). Shadow education and allocation in formal schooling: transition to university in Japan. *American Journal of sociology*, 97(6). <https://doi.org/10.1086/229942>
- Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. (1998). *Basics of qualitative research: Techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory*, 2nd (ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Syeda, T. J. (2015). Perceptions of private college teachers of Karachi about the curriculum prescribed by Sindh Bureau of Curriculum (BOC). *Acta Didactica Napocensia*, 8(4), 13-24.
- Thomas, V., Wang, Y., & Fan, X. (2001). *Measuring education inequality: Gini coefficients of education*. In: Policy Research Working Paper Series 2525 of the World Bank.
- Tracy, S. J. (2010). Qualitative quality: Eight big-tent, criteria for excellent qualitative research. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 16(10), 837-851. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077800410383121>
- Ullah, M. H. (2005). *Comparison of the quality of higher education in public and private sector institutions in Pakistan*. University of Arid Agriculture, Rawalpindi.
- United Nations Centre for Regional Development [UNCRD], (1976). *Regional Development in Sindh-A Comprehensive Planning Report*, (1)1, Nagoya, Japan.
- Watson, K. (1982). *Education in the Third World*. Published: Croom Helm Ltd.
- Weiner, B. (1986). *An attributional theory of motivation and emotion*. New York: Springer-Verlag. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4612-4948-1>
- Witt, E. A., Al-Abdulla, Y., & Ross, M. E. (1994). *The effects of coaching for aptitude tests: An updated meta-analysis*. Paper presented at the Joint Convention of the Association for Psychological and Educational Research in Kansas and the Nebraska Psychological Society, Lawrence, KS.
- Wolcott, H. F. (1991). Propriospet and the Acquisition of Culture in Anthropology. *Education Quality*, 22(3), 251-273.
- Wolf, R. M. (2002). *Extra-school instruction in mathematics and science*. In D. F. Robitaille & A. E. Beaton (Eds.), Secondary analysis of the TIMSS data (pp. 331-341). https://doi.org/10.1007/0-306-47642-8_20

Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the [Creative Commons Attribution license](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.